CERS Working Paper 2015

Multicultural harmony in Colombia?

Beth Brady

Introduction.

In Colombia it is possible for everyone to be a contender for mixture, often known as mestizaje, as it is a concept that allows for the inclusion of Afro Colombians and indigenous people, the two main minority groups in the country (Wade, 1993). Ethnic miscegenation and cultural assimilation are two processes that have had a great impact on the demographic of Colombia (Bushnell, 1993). This has partially resulted in the majority group in Colombia which is referred to by the term mestizo, used in reference to those who are of both Spanish and Indian origin (Goldberg, 2009). However, this desire for racial mixture can simultaneously lead to the exclusion of minority groups, as they can be considered non-mestizo. Furthermore, Goldberg (2009) explains how the idea of mestizaje has been promoted in some cases, due to the assumption that Indians are seen to be closer to whites than blacks, alluding to the belief of white superiority. The notion of mestizaje can therefore be argued to not include blacks as they are not part of the majority racially mixed group, but does include them as the notion of a mixed society implies that there is diversity and harmony (Goldberg, 2009). It is this contradictory ideology and the myth of racial democracy in Colombia that this case study will focus on (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008).

An interesting point that should be noted is that the notion of racial mixing was not always considered in a positive way. Goldberg (2001) discusses how polygenists, those who put forward the idea that different races evolved from different origins, argued that racial mixing would gradually cause the degenerating of a species that would eventually die out. This is a stark contrast to the attitude that Colombia conveys in its celebration of racial mixing. However, as previously indicated the result of racial mixing, the mestizos are mostly of white and Indian origin. On the other hand, those of African descendant are the most discriminated against.

It is first important to outline what is meant by the term racialisation. The term is widely used and refers to "the processes by which ideas about race are constructed, come to be regarded as meaningful, and are acted upon" (Murji and Solomos, 2005: 1). Murji and Solomos (2005) also explain how the term has been utilised in order to analyse a plethora of topics in the United Kingdom alone, such as housing patterns, crime, immigration and the media. This case study will analyse the processes of racialisation in the South American country of Colombia, particularly in regards to health, education, socio-economic status and internal conflict and the impact that it has had on the nation. As Law describes racialisation as a "dynamic process by which" racial categories and divisions "structure and embed themselves in arenas of social life", these four topics are appropriate areas of study as they are important areas of social life to the people of Colombia (Law, 2010; 59).

A summary of Colombia's history is imperative in order to provide background information and historical context in which racialisation has occurred. The Latin American country of Colombia, founded in 1819, has a population of approximately forty one point five million, of which four point two million are Afro Colombian and one point two million are indigenous peoples. Colombia is a good example of a nation which presents itself as one of mixed racial and ethnic groups living harmoniously. This is interesting as up until the 1980s many countries in Latin America "denied the existence of multiculturalism" and rejected the notion of racial inequalities altogether (Paschel, 2013: 1545). This is one of the key features that

Goldberg points out in his discussion of racial Latinamericanisation (Goldberg, 2009). It is also for this reason, that racial categories may be considered less rigid in Colombia in comparison to other countries, such as the United States, due to the fact that racism has not largely been acknowledged as institutionalised and racial mixture is instead presented in a positive way by the country (Paschal, 2013). The nation has presented itself in such a way to the extent that from 1998 to 2008, Colombian state did not take any action in an attempt to confront the issue of racial discrimination or "fulfil its obligation to report to the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination" (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008: 8). The Special Rapporteur, Doudou Diénee, concurs with this and states that following the 1996 visit, the nation did not take efficient steps to implement an act that addressed racial discrimination (Diéne, 2004).

A link can be made from this to the perception of Colombia as a racially mixed nation, as it is this supposed inclusionary society that has led to the exclusion and inequalities that are experienced by Afro Colombians (Moncada, 2010). Historically, although slavery was highly practiced in some parts of the country, it was never on the same scale as that of "Brazil or the Caribbean" (Wade, 1993: 8). However, it is still estimated that approximately one million slaves entered the Cartagena port until slavery's abolition in 1851 (Harding, 1996). Now, the majority of Afro Colombian communities, the descendants of these slaves, are located on the Pacific and Caribbean coasts; areas that are not particularly affluent and therefore have cheaper housing (Harding, 1991). Wade (1993) explains that although Afro Colombians are discriminated against, there is still acceptance on an individual level and that they are protected by the 1991 Constitution, a factor which will be discussed further in this essay. Interestingly, Colombia is one of five countries in Latin America to include an option in their national census that allows self-identification for African descendants (Goldberg, 2009). This demonstrates how Colombia has not ignored the existence of Afro Colombians in their racially mixed society.

Furthermore, indigenous people and Afro Colombians have expressed feelings that the situation they are in is precarious compared to the mestizo majority (Diéne, 2004). This can be linked to the fact that Colombian class hierarchy has historically been largely shaped by race and ethnicity (Wade, 1993). Whites and mestizos were and to some extent still are seen as superior in comparison to Afro Colombians and indigenous people. An example of this is given by the two marginalised groups who have argued that there is a much greater emphasis on the Hispanic heritage of Colombia, as opposed to that of the indigenous and Afro Colombians, even though it is presented as a multicultural state. This idea will be analysed further in the section of the case study that discusses education.

Moreover, Colombia is a country that has been greatly affected by war and violence, especially due to concerns over social justice and human rights (Wade, 1993). Those who are found to suffer the most as a result of this internal conflict are the minority groups (Human Rights Watch, 2015). Discussion of this aspect of racialisation will be developed in the section focusing on conflict in this essay.

By focusing on discrimination in health, education, socio-economic position and impact of conflict, Goldberg's critical race theory is the most appropriate model to apply to Colombia (Goldberg, 2001). Within this, Goldberg explains how race "marks and orders the modern nation-state", which can by evidenced by the class hierarchy in Colombia of which race is an important categorising factor (Goldberg, 2001: 4). Evidence of racialised governance in Colombia and how the needs of minority groups are not highly prioritised can be used to further support Goldberg's theory. Furthermore, as mestizaje is a notion common amongst many Latin American countries, there is a hierarchy introduced which is focused on the degree of racial mixture a country experiences, as well as the racially related class hierarchy within the countries (Wade, 2010). This refers to the part of Goldberg's model that emphasises the interconnections between Colombia and external racialisation existing in other places.

Information provided by the Special Rapporteur, which commissioned an analysis of Colombia in October 2003, will be used in this case study (Diéne, 2004). As this document states, racial discrimination in Colombia mostly impacts the Afro Colombian population and the indigenous people. The Special Rapporteur will be used alongside other sources to analyse racialisation in Colombia, with particular focus on the discrimination that Afro Colombians face.

Inequalities found when it comes to the health of Afro Colombian and indigenous people compared to the mestizo majority.

A key aspect in which racial discrimination can be seen in Colombia, is health. The United Nations Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) (2009) expressed concern over the health care that minorities were receiving in Colombia. It also discussed the lack of efficient data collected on health care and the general health of Afro Colombians and indigenous people in comparison to that of the mestizos.

Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) wrote of a personal experience when visiting Colombia, involving seeing a black child with a hernia on her stomach and learning that this is not only common but also widely considered symbolic of the weaknesses in the health care system. A link can be made between this anecdote and the 2005 census which stated that the Afro Colombian infant mortality rate is twice that of the majority population. In fact, forty four out of one thousand black females die in the first year of their lives; a main factor of which is improper birthing techniques which can cause stomach hernias (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008). A possible explanation for such figures is that Afro Colombians simply cannot afford to pay into health care insurance policies.

Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) also comments on the issue of hunger among Afro Colombians; as during the week that the 2005 census took place, fourteen per cent of Afro Colombians did not eat on at least one of them days. It should be noted that this is double the amount of mestizo that are effected by the issue of hunger.

Moreover, in 1995, Flavio Rodriguez, the Deputy Attorney General of Colombia, stated that eighty per cent of the population living in the countryside, mainly those indigenous groups, did not have adequate access to health services. This is due to lack of roads and public transport, as well as internal conflict making travelling difficult (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008). Rodriguez emphasised that these people were "unprotected by the public health system" (Harding, 1996: 16). This is a factor which is likely to contribute to that fact that Afro Colombian men have a life expectancy which is almost six years lowers that the majority population. More shockingly, Afro Colombian women have a life expectancy which is approximately eleven years lower (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008).

Furthermore, Afro Colombians have expressed negative attitudes concerning their access to basic services in Colombia, one of which was health care services (World Bank, 2005 cited in Moncada, 2010). Again, this is a consequence of the coastal locations of Afro Colombian communities. However, certain efforts have been made to improve this and now Cali, one of the country's largest cities, is acclaimed internationally for its "preventative citizen security policies" which were implemented between 1992 and 1994 (Moncada, 2010: 703). This accolade is contested to a certain extent though, as only forty nine per cent of the Afro Colombian population are entered into the health care system, as opposed to approximately seventy per cent of white mestizos (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008). Along with lack of access, Afro Colombians experience health services that have unsafe and unsanitary conditions as well as suffering from insufficient supply of water and bad sewage systems (Diéne, 2004).

Furthermore, it is possible to compare health services between Afro Colombians and the indigenous people. In 2001, Law 691 emphasised their right to health care and enabled

indigenous communities to set up organisations which allowed them to provide health care for its people (Diéne, 2004). However, Afro Colombians have not been granted a similar law. In fact, Afro Colombians are not permitted to practice their traditional treatment within the Colombian health care system (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008).

The racial discrimination in Colombia in terms of education, both access and quality.

In 1993, Act 70 was implemented in Colombia which stated that black communities had the "right to an education geared to the needs and cultural aspirations" of the community (Diéne, 2004: 6). However, education in Colombia has been described as being of low quality in neighbourhoods that are predominantly freed slave descendants (Medina Uribe, 2014). This links to a finding in the Special Rapporteur which denotes that the number of illiterate Afro Colombians is three times that of the rest of the population (Diéne, 2004). CERD (2009) also emphasised this issue and indicated that the state has not yet managed to guarantee every child free primary education.

Also linked to this are findings presented by Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) which explains that not only are Afro Colombians discriminated against when it comes to accessing education but also the low level of education they receive when they are able to access it. Indigenous populations experience low quality education which is said to be due to a lack of teachers as well as education services and facilities (Diéne, 2004). An explanation put forward by indigenous people is that they face discrimination in education due to religion. This is due to the fact that the Catholic Church govern the educational institutions in Colombia, which is problematic for the indigenous as they are not Catholic (Diéne, 2004). This immediately puts indigenous students at a disadvantage and therefore contests the notion of Colombia as a harmonious multicultural state.

Furthermore, as previously mentioned, it was found that Colombia has not fulfilled its obligation to ensure free primary education to all Afro Colombians. Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) presents the figure of eleven per cent when referring to the amount of Afro Colombian children who are not able to access primary education. This figure increases to twenty seven per cent when it comes to higher education. This is an example of how low socio-economic status is linked to education. If a family cannot afford to pay for their child to go to school then the child is less likely to experience upward social mobility as a result.

Wade (1993) discusses how a process of racial mixing, or mestizaje, has impacted upon Colombia, an example of which is within education itself. Medina Uribe (2014) explains how often people prefer to refer to themselves as mestizos and how in school, children are taught that Colombia is a mixed country. This is interesting as the 1991 Constitution along with the 1993 Law of Black Communities included the studying of Afro Colombian culture and history as part of the school curriculum (Paschal, 2013). Cott (1996) has suggested that presenting Colombia as a mixed nation is a preference of intellectuals as they consider racial heterogeneity to be a weakness (cited in Moncada, 2010). Despite these policies, Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) states that teaching about racism itself has not been introduced and that racist stereotypes about Afro Colombians being unintelligent, for example, persist.

As will be discussed in more detail later in the essay, a number of policies were put in place, known as Desepaz, a number of which were centred round the issue of education. These were mainly to build schools in impoverished areas which are home to many Afro Colombian and indigenous people and to also introduce training programmes for teachers to improve the quality of education for racial minorities (Moncada, 2010). These initiatives can be used to show that racial inequalities in education have not always been ignored by the Colombian government. However, Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) explains that in order to improve the quality of education and offer teaching of Afro Colombian history, teachers need to be

trained to do so, something that has not yet been addressed. It can therefore be seen that the state must fully commit to guaranteeing culturally sensitive education to all in Colombia (CERD, 2009).

How an individual's socio-economic situation is impacted by the racial or ethnic group they belong too.

A person's race largely links to their socio-economic situation in Colombia. Koopman (2013) explains how this is racialised as there is a pattern involving a person's racial group and their access to wealth, power and their status. This is how structural discrimination can be exemplified in Colombia, as the minorities are disadvantaged when it comes to employment and therefore their social position.

There is a link between geographical location and racial discrimination (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008). An example of this is the fact that areas which home a lot of Afro Colombians, such as the Pacific coast, are not largely effected when it comes to public policies (Diéne, 2004). The Special Rapporteur explains that for the years between 1998 and 2002, the Afro Colombian community were assigned one point six billion pesos in order to improve basic services and create employment opportunities (Diéne, 2004). However, this plan was consequently not largely implemented. Additionally, a link between geographical factors and racial discrimination can be seen as it was found that the five areas in Colombia that experience the highest rates of poverty, are the areas that also have the highest population of Afro Colombians (Peters, 2011). This demonstrates how Colombian government do not prioritise the needs of the Afro Colombian people.

The lack of government intervention in improving the situation of the Afro Colombians is defended by some. It has been argued that the coastal regions that mainly Afro Colombians populate are complex and inhospitable places and that that is the reason that the inhabitants face problems such as poverty, not a lack of government action (Diéne, 2004; Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al*, 2008).

As discussed in the section regarding education, the Special Rapporteur on Colombia explains that the illiteracy rate among Afro-Colombians is high (Diéne, 2004). An interesting link can be made between educational inequalities and socio-economic outcomes, especially when referring to employment. As previously discussed, indigenous people face unsatisfactory education which is likely to be a factor that consequently means their unemployment rate is at seventy per cent (Diéne, 2004).

Another example of this can be seen in an article which discusses the case of a job advertisement requiring the applicants to be "of white skin" (Medina Uribe, 2014). This is an example of "explicit discrimination" as a certain racialised group are at a direct disadvantage (Law, 2009: 174). Similar to this case, Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) explains how some companies have a no black employment policy altogether. This discrimination in Colombia can perhaps be explained by how there is the assumption in Colombia that those of darker skin are of lower class than those of lighter skin (Medina Uribe, 2014).

Favouring of light skin is also commented on in Koopman's article (Koopman, 2013). Koopman explains how as a person of light skin, she is greatly aware of her hyper visibility when in Colombia (Koopman, 2013). She goes on to link this to advertisements, not just for jobs but also health and beauty products as a large proportion of models are light skinned, often blonde and have either blue or green eyes, frequently due to contact lenses which are vastly becoming a key trend in the nation (Koopman, 2013). Furthermore, Koopman discusses the fact that a person is able to use these whitening techniques, such has dying hair a fairer colour, to "improve their ability to get a better paying job" (Koopman, 2013). These examples are useful ways in which to explain how Colombians' socio-economic situations are effected by racialisation.

Also related to this point is one which focuses upon social mobility. Wade (1993) explains how blacks in Colombia have been able to advance by adapting to the wider culture but also by marrying a person of a lighter complexion. It is believed that the mixed children, produced by inter-racial couples, have less chance of experiencing discrimination due to their lighter skin tone (Wade, 1993). This can be related to Goldberg's theory of racial Latinamericanisation, in which he outlines a correlation between whiteness and socio-economic position (Goldberg, 2009). However, there are some cases where inter-marriage has caused controversy and viewed as a betrayal of the black community (Wade, 1993). Goldberg (2001) explains why negative attitudes towards racial mixing exist with reference to eighteenth and nineteenth century scientific racism. He discusses how the notion of hybridity became representative of illusions of pollution of purity among the races, most commonly, white Europeans.

Furthermore, Moncada (2010) carried out a study which showed the correlation between race and impoverished areas in Colombia. Again, this greatly showed the disadvantage that Afro Colombians are at. The city of Cali is home to the largest population of people who are of African heritage and has been a popular place that Afro Colombians have migrated to for the last sixty years (Moncada, 2010). However, at forty per cent of the population, the majority of those who reside in Cali, Afro Colombians, in fact live in the impoverished outskirts of the city, known as the Aguablanca. This once again displays the low socio-economic situation Afro Colombians are in, compared to the remaining population, which causes a lack of access to services and opportunities (Moncada, 2010). Cali and in particular Aguablanca will be focused on later in the essay, with reference to crime and violence.

Additionally, also focusing on the situation of Afro Colombians, Paschel carried out a study analysing the significance of blackness in Colombia (Paschel, 2013). Paschel (2013) argues that the legislation put in place in the 1991 Constitution, was an example of how blackness has been institutionalised in Colombia. Paschal (2013) has also pointed out that some Afro Colombians are reluctant to claim the black part of their identity due to the low level at which blacks, along with indigenous people, are situated on the racial hierarchy in Colombia. Evidence of the low socio-economic situation of indigenous people but mainly Afro Colombians is the fact that in 2008, Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* found that approximately sixty per cent of those part of black communities were living under the poverty line in Colombia (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008).

In order to attempt to improve the socio economic situation of those in poor areas, in the mid to late ninties, Mayor Rodrigo Guerrero introduced several initiatives referred to as Development, Security and Peace, also known as Desepaz (Moncada, 2010). These initiatives were used in particular areas, one of which was Aguablanca, this therefore shows a way in which Colombian government made an effort to include Afro Colombians as those are the main residents of this area. However, Afro Colombians continually express the feeling that any progress that the government did make has since declined in importance (Diéne, 2004).

The CERD Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (2009) reiterates the vulnerability of Afro Colombians and indigenous people and emphasises the need for the nation to strictly introduce measures that guarantee the minority groups an equal quality of life and equal human rights.

How Afro Colombians and indigenous people are effected by internal conflict, violence and crime.

Linking to the previous section, there is a connection between low socio-economic status and crime and violence. Moncada (2010) explains that poor conditions, most frequently

experienced by those in indigenous groups and black communities situated on the outskirts of the cities, have led to violent incidents been used as an attempt to gain power. Additionally, Moncada (2010) explains how the programmes set out by Desepaz were created around the belief that racial divergences are a key factor that has led to violence and criminal activity altogether. These programmes included "peace and conflict resolution training" as well as a continuing of research on violence and crime (Moncada, 2010: 705). However, the ultimate success of these initiatives is greatly limited as Desepaz stopped have a central role in 1994, when Mayor Guerrero left his official position. This decentralising of importance in Desepaz is a reason Afro Colombians, and indigenous people also continue to express feelings of dissatisfaction (Dièn, 2004). The staff working on Desepaz was subsequently cut, as was the financial budget (Moncada, 2010). Since 1985 more than five point seven million Colombians have been displaced, illustrating the racial element to this issue (Human Rights Watch, 2015). It is now estimated that twelve point three per cent of Afro Colombians are living in a state of forced displacement (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008).

Koopman (2013) discussed how Colombia is divided into different regions and that these regions often are associated with a certain race. The historic belief that white skin is superior, especially among Colombian colonial elites persists (Koopman, 2013). The idea of racially divided regions links to displacement, a key impact of conflict. It is these regions, home to mainly black communities that experience daily crossfire. Afro Colombians and the indigenous people are among those who have suffered the worst violence and displacement (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008; Koopman, 2013). CERD (2009) even stated that certain groups of indigenous people are at risk of extinction due to the impact armed conflict has on them. Furthermore, it has been stated that the likelihood of Afro Colombians being displaced is eighty four per cent higher than it is for the mestizo majority (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008). A statistic which was also raised in the Special Rapporteur (Dièn, 2004). Furthermore, forced migration as a result of a natural disaster is at a level twice that of whites or mestizos, for Afro Colombians (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008).

Another impact of the conflict Colombia has experienced is disputes and violence over ownership of land. This impact is racialised as disputes are largely occurring involving small farm owners, often of Afro Colombian or indigenous heritage (Koopman, 2013). Previously considered unappealing and waste like, their land is now viewed as places that have not been used to their full potential. Related to this is the high level of forced displacement among Afro Colombians, as this consequently results in inconsistent data collection on the ownership of land (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008).

As mentioned previously, the poor area in Cali, known as Aguablanca is home to many Afro Colombians. Moncada (2010) found that it is in this area that twenty five per cent of homicides that occurred in Cali between 2000 and 2007 took place. This is a factor that has contributed to the high mortality rate of those that are black and between the ages of fifteen and nineteen (Moncada, 2010). This high mortality rate among Afro Colombians in Cali is in fact double that of the non-black people.

This stigmatisation has been argued to contribute to acts of violence as they allow an alternative way for blacks to assert power (Moncada, 2010). It is also this stigmatisation that Afro Colombians have attributed to as reason that they may not wish to leave their black communities as non-black people often assume that if they do, then it is because they are preparing to commit a crime (Moncada, 2010).

The World Report 2015 has stated that Afro Colombians and indigenous leaders receive the most death threats and violence and although these attacks are greatly detested, little is done in order to fully investigate them (Human Rights Watch, 2015). Therefore, this consequently means that the offenders rarely receive any punishment.

Concluding remarks.

As Goldberg (2009) explained, racial Latinamericanisation presents the disadvantages of mestizaje as displaying Colombia as a harmonious place of racial mixture has often led to an overlooking of the situations of the Afro Colombian and indigenous people. This is exemplified in the Special Rapporteur on Colombia which states that, in article 13 of the 1991 Constitution ensures all men and women in Colombia are equal before the law (Diéne, 2004). However, in spite of this, as this case study has shown, both Afro Colombians and indigenous people experience discrimination in a number of areas including, health, education, socio-economic position and violence and impacts of conflict.

Afro Colombians and indigenous people face a great amount of discrimination when it comes to health, in terms of both access and quality. A way to rectify this would be to introduce policies that allow for Afro Colombian traditional treatment to be practiced within the Colombian health care system (Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al,* 2008). This would give Afro Colombians more power within the health care system which would therefore contribute towards the improving of the health care for those communities. CERD (2009) discussed the need for similar policies such as the devising of a strategy that would ensure that all people in Colombia receive adequate health care by quality resources.

In terms of education, inequalities in access and quality have been discussed in this case study. Rodriguez-Garavito *et. al* (2008) suggested a way in which this problem could be solved by the prioritisation of resources which would in turn guarantee Afro Colombian children good quality and free education. This consequently would have a positive effect on the socio-economic situation of the minority groups. As this case study has shown these two aspects in an Afro Colombians or indigenous person life are linked to each other.

Furthermore, greater investigations and punishments should be carried out on those who exhibit direct discrimination such as in employment as the job advertisement previously mentioned did (Medina Uribe, 2014).

With reference to the impact of armed conflict and violence, CERD highlights the importance of the Colombian's state responsibility to protect the minorities that are most effected and at risk (CERD, 2009). This is due to the fact that, as this case study has proven, minority groups such as the Afro Colombians and indigenous people are forcibly displaced at a rate greater to that of mestizos and experience more crime on the whole. CERD (2009) has hence outlined the need for the state to protect minority groups through political solutions and ensure that they are granted their human rights. The Special Rapporteur simultaneously stresses the need for the implementation of a policy that addresses the racial dimensions of the internal conflict and crime in Colombian (Diéne, 2004).

To conclude, by studying the case of racial discrimination in Colombia, a number of important lessons can be learned. One of great significance is the issue of prioritising the needs of minority groups in order to end the institutionalised racism they face in many aspects of society such as, health, education, socio-economic positions and impacts of violence. Although CERD (2009) acknowledges that there has been an effort by the state of Colombia to meet the targets that aim to better the situations of Afro Colombians and indigenous people, their conditions continue to be precarious. Discrimination in many aspects of Colombian society must be addressed in order to improve the situation of the minority groups; if none discriminatory employment policies were greater enforced, for example, Afro Colombians and indigenous people would have greater opportunities for social mobility which would allow them to afford mainland housing, closer to health services. Policies addressing discrimination must be enforced more strictly. As has been explained in this case study, programmes have too often been introduced but then not implemented to the fullest extent in such a way that would have a significant impact on minority groups.

Bibliography

Bushnell, D. 1993. *The Making of Modern Colombia: A Nation in Spite of Itself.* Berkley: University of California Press.

Diène, D. 2004. Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and All Forms of Discrimination: Mission to Colombia. *United Nations Economic and Social Council.* 4(3), pp.2-18

Goldberg, D. T. 2001. *The Racial State.* Malden: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

Goldberg, D. T. 2009. *The Threat of Race: Reflections on Racial Neoliberalism.* Malden: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

Harding, C. 1996. *Colombia in Focus: A Guide to the People, Politics and Culture.* London: Latin America Bureau.

Human Rights Watch. 2015. *World Report: Colombia.* [Online]. [Accessed 3 May 2015]. Available from: http://www.hrw.org/world-report/2015/country-chapters/colombia

Koopman, S. 2013. *The Racialisation of Accompaniment; Can Privilege be Used Transparently?* [Online]. [Accessed 14 April 2015]. Available from: http://forusa.org/fellowship/2013/summer/racialization-accompaniment/12377

Law, I. 2010. *Racism and Ethnicity: Global Debates, Dilemmas, Directions.* Essex: Pearson Education Limited.

Medina Uribe, P. 2014. *Let's Talk About Racism In Colombia.* [Online]. [Accessed 14 April 2015]. Available from: http://africasacountry.com/lets-talk-about-racism-in-colombia/

Moncada, E. 2010. Counting Bodies: Crime Mapping, Policing and Race in Colombia. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* 33(4), pp.696-716.

Murji, K. and Solomos, J. 2005. *Racialization: Studies in Theory and Practice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Paschel, T. 2013. 'The Beautiful Faces of my Black People'; Race, Ethnicity and the Politics of Colombia's 2005 Census. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* 36(10), pp.1544-1563.

Peters, T. 2011. *UN Calls for Colombia to Outlaw Discrimination.* [Online]. [Accessed 6 May 2015]. Available from: http://colombiareports.co/racial-discrimination-in-colombia-must-be-criminalized-ohchr/

Rodriguez-Garavito, C. et al. 2008. *Racial Discrimination and Human Rights in Colombia: A Report on the Situation of the Rights of Afro-Colombians.* [Online]. [Accessed 24 April 2015]. Available from:
http://www.tiannapaschel.com/uploads/Racial_Discrimination_and_Human_Right_-_Colombia.pdf

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination. 2009. United Nations: International Convention on the Elimination on all Forms of Racial Discrimination. [Online]. [Accessed 3 May 2015]. Available from:
http://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=6QkG1d%2fPPRiCAqhKb7yh suLy1eXuFTGvtzmO%2f9j1FlfqTlqMDB1OtgAxG2LWkh7RkPZP0zun4czj0e8Jsch9PN3HX9 hKTPGUDMnIVTU%2f5WYwdCfyhCktDmFyJlnvcRqb

Wade, P. 1993. *Blackness and Race Mixture: The Dynamics of Racial Identity in Colombia.* London: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Wade, P. 2010. Racial Identity and Nationalism: A Theoretical View from Latin America. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* 24(5), pp.845-865.