Emma Greenough

Spain's Historical Paradox: Racism and Reliance on African Migrants

Introduction

Increased immigration in Europe has led to high levels of xenophobia in Spain, creating a public discourse which excludes migrants, despite the country's reliance on them to uphold the agricultural market. Spain has historically been a country which exports its own people as migrant workers (Sole and Parella, 2003, p.121), but over the last decade the process has been reversed. Spain has been subject to a huge influx of migrant workers, with foreign populations on a steady increase rising to a peak of 12.22% of the whole population in 2012 (Spanish Institute of Statistics, 2015). This has provoked xenophobic attitudes (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013) and anti-migrant debate, leading to policies which exclude migrants from healthcare and housing. Migrants are mostly limited to the industries of construction and agriculture, working in menial labour roles which Spanish nationals do not want (Corkill, 2001). While Spain's unemployment rate is the highest of any EU country, standing at 21.6% in September 2015 (Eurostat, 2015), it is unsurprising that Spanish nationals avoid jobs in agriculture, as workers are low-paid and subject to dangerous conditions which significantly threaten their health. The industry is therefore the most available for migrant access, and as a result Spain is reliant on its migrant population to uphold the agricultural market and ensure some economic stance throughout Spain's recession. However, since the peak of migrant workers in 2012, migrant numbers are now decreasing, with many more leaving Spain than coming in. The country has undergone huge growth after immigration increases, but the resulting increase in house prices and unemployment have meant that the country is no longer an affordable place for migrants who remain segregated to low-paid roles (Buck, 2014). It is therefore the limitations put on migrants which are driving them out of Spain in search of better living elsewhere.

Spain's exclusionary discourse was historically imposed by the state, and although the state has recently implemented measures to promote equality and inclusion of migrants, the public sphere maintains xenophobic and racist attitudes which prevent the integration and inclusion of migrants. African workers, as the majority of migrants, are by far the most marginalised and segregated of migrants as a result of durable historical racisms which are still evident in industry and public discourse today. Africans have consistently been reported as having experienced significant racism in the country (European Council against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), 2010), in comparison to other migrants who experience none (Arango, 2013, p.2). This piece will first examine the development of a public racial discourse, determining that racisms against Africans have long existed, developing as a result of historical hostilities encouraged by the state. However, it will be theorised that these hostilities have been exacerbated by the migration crisis in Europe, and so the piece will support Goldberg's theory of relational racism (2009). The main body will assess how an exclusionary discourse is implemented in the areas of employment, housing and education, depicting how both African adults and children are affected by racial hierarchy in Spain. Comparisons will be made, where enough evidence exists, of the different treatment between Africans and other migrants in order to illustrate the racial hierarchy within migrant exclusion. The fact that most recent literature fails to distinguish between different sub-groups of Africans would suggest that Africans as a whole now experience a generalised racism based on skin colour, which has developed from a singular racism towards Moroccans. A final section will explore the expectation from the public for migrants to show willingness to integrate, although it is the public discourse which ensures migrants are isolated and segregated from society. This section will analyse the support which NGOs provide to migrants to facilitate their integration and assess trade union activity in ensuring Africans regain equal opportunities among other migrants, as they are the most disadvantaged of all migrants due to racism. Despite efforts, it will be concluded that the work does not go far enough. African migrants remain in high risk situations with little voice and little chance of integration as they remain segregated from access to information due to their exclusion from society.

While the state has recently implemented measures which attempt to integrate Africans and migrants in general, these measures remain unenforced due to racisms and xenophobia within industry and the minds of the public. This has allowed exclusionary practices to continue. It will follow that, if Spain is to eradicate racism towards some of its most valuable workers, racist attitudes need addressing on an individual and agency level through engagement and education.

Race Relations: Modern Day as a Reflection of Historical Conflict

Racism specifically towards Moroccans is related to historical local events within and around Spain, however in recent years these racisms have been intensified during Europe's migration crisis. Spain's historic and lengthy war against 'the Moors' throughout the Middle Ages was inevitably the starting point of these racisms, as Spain's first, most significant conflict with Africans. The Moors were North Africans of Muslim faith who colonised part of the Iberian Peninsula from 711 onwards (Borreguero, 2006), fuelling a territorial conflict for hundreds of years, ending eventually in the fifteenth century with expulsion of the Moors from Spain (van Dijk, 2005). During the conflict, the Moors were demonised as inferior barbaric savages (Singhji, 2011, p.117) in comparison to Spanish Christians. Their Islamic faith was seen as a threat to the cultural identity of Spain, with rulers claiming the country had lost its "Hispania" in the Muslim invasion and settlement in Spain (Borreguero, 2006). The demonising of the Moors allowed North Africans to become associated with inferiority and labelled as a sort of vermin to be overruled by Christianity. This made a state-imposed link between darker skin, Islamic faith and inferiority which would generate support for the overthrowing of Muslim Spain and allowed anti-African racism to become the norm at this time. After the conflict was won by the Spanish, the anti-African attitude remained, as the country joined France and Great Britain in the occupation of parts of Morocco during the early 1900s. The occupation was met by Moroccan resistance and eventually led to the Spanish Civil War (Balfour, 2002). This is significant as the Moroccan role in the conflict is often portrayed by Spanish historians as defiant, unruly and immoral, however it is unsurprising that Moroccans resisted the rule of a country which segregated and expelled their ancestors (Balfour, 2002). The portrayal of Moroccans throughout Spanish history is therefore tainted by historical views which criminalise Moroccans as a lesser, dishonest and threatening race (Soyer, 2013), influencing modern day thinking in Spain and inevitably encouraging anti-Moroccan racism. Despite local roots, the racism has been intensified by increased migration within Europe (Goldberg, 2009) and now seems to apply to those with darker skin or African origin more generally. Spain has experienced a heightened sense of xenophobia in the midst of the European migration crisis, which has led to restrictions on migrant access to facilities and citizenship (Domínguez-Mujica et al, 2014), and the excess choice of European migrant workers has led to a rise in unemployment for Africans (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013). While anti-migrant attitudes increase, it would seem that amongst this, Spanish anti-Moroccan racisms have widened to include all Africans in modern times as a result of historical demonization of darker skin colours and an increased choice of European workers meaning that whites can be chosen over Africans. This specific racism therefore falls within Goldberg's relational approach (2009), with the state-imposed racism developing locally but distinctly aggravated by recent events across Europe.

During the conflict with the Moors, Spain as a state developed a heavily inflated importance of religion in both its own cultural identity and determining the worth of a person or race. This inevitably led to a form of religious hierarchy, and therefore a racial hierarchy segregating 'lesser' faiths, which remains in Spain today as a form of exclusionary discourse. During the conflicts, the following of Islam or Judaism justified the segregation of whole communities (Pérez, 1993) in an attempt to make clear separation between what was deemed to be the superior religion of Catholicism and religions which were seen as inferior. Those who converted to Catholicism were spared segregation (Pérez, 1993), and those who refused to convert were taxed (Meer, 2015), clearly as an attempt to impose Spain's 'superior' religion onto other races. However, as it was determined that converts maintained practice of Islam in private the Spanish began to expel the Islamic community to Morocco, eventually ending the conflict entirely (Borreguero, 2006). This depicts Spain's inflation of the threat from other religions, and facilitated the use of exclusionary discourse in Spain. On the expulsion of the Islamic community, Spain began to officially determine nationality through the doctrine *limpieza de sangre* – purity of the blood. Spain's focus on purity is specifically directed towards purity from Jewish or Muslim faith (Hering Torres et al. 2012, p.15) and therefore facilitates cultural racisms which had inevitably

developed from the recent conflicts with other religions. The doctrine reflects the use of segregation in the conflict and would seem to remain at the heart of Spain's national identity, as the country maintains an inflated importance of religion in modern day, accepting only cultures which align with Spanish tradition and Catholicism.

Despite the state's turn around in current times to integrate migrants, Africans in modern Spain have become subject to racism from the public and industries as a result of historical racialisation of Islam and the demonising of darker skin colours. For Spanish citizens, Islam has been racialized to darker skin colours, and been considered a threat to Spain's cultural identity (Soyer, 2013). For the majority of African workers now entering Spain, many are of Islamic faith (ECRI, 2003), leaving them immediately subjected to racisms for their connection to Islam. Nonetheless, due to the racialisation of the religion, Africans in modern Spain are segregated and marginalised in a hierarchy which perceives a link between darker skin and Islam as denoting an inferior race. Spain is therefore based on a framework which allows religion to set the racial hierarchy, based on assumptions and generalisations about skin colour. While Moroccans are set at the bottom of this hierarchy as a result of durable long-term racisms towards them specifically, Africans are now also subjected to this same racism as darker skin colours have become generalised as Islamic races in Spain. This idea runs contrary to the majority of Western Europe, which racializes Muslims to be Asian (Modood, 2005). Therefore, it is obvious that Spain's concepts of racism have derived mainly from local historic hostilities, rather than through influence of surrounding countries, contradicting the idea that European racisms are all similar (Goldberg, 2009). Yet it is clear that Spain's non-acceptance of Africans has been influenced by the migration crisis in Europe. The increase in migrant workers has meant that preferential treatment is given to white European migrants rather than Africans, implementing racism based on skin colour. The following sections will demonstrate and analyse the way in which Africans have been marginalised within Spain's exclusionary racial discourse more specifically and as a result endure many disadvantages in terms of access to employment, healthcare, housing and education.

African Migrants in Agriculture

Employers clearly perceive migrants as the most dispensable and renewable of workers, and so they endure the most hazardous conditions in employment. Most migrants, particularly Africans, travel to Spain for employment in the areas of construction and agriculture or other services which only require low skills (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014, p.308). These industries pose significant safety threats and so it may be unsurprising that Spanish nationals do not aspire for employment in these sectors. While African workers migrate to Spain most likely with the intention of bettering their lifestyle (Sánchez-Pardo, 2011, p.107), it is unlikely that the harsh conditions of their employment allow for this enhancement (Paloma et al, 2014, p.2). Within agriculture, migrant workers in general are only employed seasonally for one year, for long working days and usually only on verbal contracts (Corkill, 2011, p.25-28). Employers use "piece-pay" to maintain low wages (Corkill, 2011, p.28), ensuring that migrants remain the lowest paid workers in Spain. Many of the migrants are illegal and so unable to complain to authorities when subjected to harsh conditions and illegal payment practices (Corkill, 2011, p.28). "Inhumane and degrading" conditions in migrant employment (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013) portray the low status which migrants are given in Spain, with poor working conditions completely disregarding their human rights. Clearly, in the midst of the migration crisis, migrants in Spain are set at the bottom of the social hierarchy. The conditions which migrants endure in the industry signifies a careless attitude towards the health and economic wellbeing of migrants, as they are seen as renewable and expendable due to the large amount of migrants entering the country.

While migrants in general are subject to poor working conditions and poor pay, Africans in particular remain the most limited and isolated from access to employment as employers now implement racist selection processes, preventing Africans from obtaining work. Since the migration crisis, many Africans have begun struggling to find employment in Spain, with unemployment of the group rising to over 50% in recent years (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013). This is inevitably due to the increased choice in European migrants. Farmers perceive Africans as "unproductive" and disobedient in comparison to other migrants (Corkill, 2011, p.27-28). These views clearly reflect the historical attitudes of criminalising Africans, suggesting that these views are still influential today. With an increased availability of white workers, employers in agriculture have begun using racist selection processes which give preference to Europeans, despite many denying the use of racist assumptions

(Corkill, 2011). The rise in unemployment of Africans cannot be amounted simply to a language barrier, as although farmers have been shown to prefer employing Ukrainians or Polish workers, they too suffer a language barrier in Spain (Corkill, 2011). Therefore, it is clear that within the agriculture industry a racial hierarchy has been implemented in recent years, as white migrants have become more readily available. The racial hierarchy is therefore locally implemented by individual employers, but related to events within the surrounding international sphere (Goldberg, 2009). Historic views which portray Africans as an inferior and disobedient race are still present in the agriculture industry, as these attitudes have been revealed as a wider pool of workers has become available. For years, as the majority of migrants, Africans have been able to secure work in agriculture, but as Europeans become more prevalent in Spain, racist attitudes have been exposed by the preferential treatment of white workers and the increase in unemployment of Africans.

Africans who are able to find employment are limited to working in low-skilled roles due to a lack of sufficient skills and employer perception of African inferiority, therefore leaving Africans to remain the most financially unstable of all migrant workers (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014, p.311). Recent studies show that Africans endure the harsh working conditions of greenhouses for much longer than Latin American migrants, with this group more easily moving on into higher-paid industries (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014, pp.311). It may be the case that many African workers do not possess the correct skills for higher paid employment, yet Latin Americans are well-known to receive preferential treatment in Spain (Sánchez-Pardo, 2011) and so the difference in treatment cannot go ignored. Spanish preference towards Latin Americans suggests that the racial hierarchy implemented in the employment industry puts significant importance on cultural identity. As Latin Americans share the national language of Spain and relate to the same origin, it is unsurprising that Latin Americans assimilate into higher employment much easier considering the inflated importance Spain gives to its own cultural identity. As a race which significantly contrasts with Spain's sense of identity, African migrants remain trapped in high-risk and low-paid employment, without the necessary skills to expand into higher-paid roles (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014). Conditions in employment seem even harsher for African women, as many are victims of trafficking and are forced into prostitution alongside their agricultural work (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013), which has been reported as the case for over a decade (Corkill, 2001). As a form of modern slavery, the trafficking of African women depicts the low status of Africans in Spain and their inability to find help due to their isolation in rural greenhouses. A lack of access to help with employment and finance therefore leads Africans into the criminal sphere, simply reinforcing the historic view of African criminalisation. This lack of access to help has allowed Africans to remain the lowest paid workers in Spain. Moroccans have shown to be the Africans with the highest wages, which can only be explained by Spain's "European Neighbourhood Policy" (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014 p.326). Despite the existence of a racial hierarchy, the agreement has facilitated Moroccan integration in Spanish society, intended to assimilate Moroccans to Spanish culture which perhaps even allows Moroccans to move into other industries of employment. However, because this neighbour plan does not stretch to accommodate all African migrants, Africans in general remain under the worst conditions economically. Therefore, Africans seem to lack the necessary skills for higher paid work in Spain, but are also excluded from low-paid work now due to employer preference to European migrants. Where Africans manage to secure employment, the working conditions and payment leave much to be desired. As a result, it is unsurprising that more migrants are leaving Spain than are coming in, as the conditions run distinctly contrary to the migrant aspiration of a better lifestyle.

<u>Housing African Workers</u>
The segregation of Africans to either low-paid work or unemployment means that they are unable to afford housing of good quality, although xenophobic selection processes in housing mean that Africans and other migrants are segregated to poorer housing despite their financial status. Therefore, Africans must endure harsh working conditions in their jobs, and endure the same poor conditions in their homes. In general, housing conditions depict the status of a person and show the extent to which a person is integrated into society, but it can also directly affect how well a person is able to integrate into society (Meier, 2013). Due to poor pay in their employment, Africans are forced to find areas which offer housing for low rent, which usually means that they must congregate in the poorest areas of Spain (Corkill, 2001). However, it is theorised that these areas only become the poorest areas due to the out-

migration of Spaniards who hold xenophobic attitudes (Martinez Veiga, 2014). This would suggest that the congregating of 'outsiders' generates exclusionist attitudes from Spanish nationals (Escandell and Ceobanu, 2009) facilitating segregation and preventing Africans from integrating into Spanish society due to society's rejection and exclusion of them. Since the beginning of their migration in the 1990s, Africans have lived rurally in Spain, in extremely poor housing which lacked water and electricity, completely segregated from the rest of society (Meier, 2013). Not only this, but it would seem that over the last decade overcrowding has also become an issue (Meier, 2013). While African communities still tend to congregate, this congregation is now within the same household, with many migrants having "less than one room per person at their disposal" (Meier, 2013). Overcrowded housing lacking basic amenities and sanitation paints the dim view which Spanish housing authorities take of black migrants. Housing agencies display high xenophobic traits in even the idea of letting to migrants, and show specific discrimination towards ethnic minorities. This is shown through policies which refuse letting to non-EU nationals, and agents not showing up to house viewings for migrants (Harrison et al, 2005). Evidently, it is these practices of housing agencies which facilitate the physical segregation of Africans and migrants, as agencies are able to effectively select where migrants will live. Should Africans manage to acquire rented accommodation despite this, Africans must still pay more rent than if the tenant was a Spanish national (Law, 2009, p.175). The charging of higher rents for Africans than Spaniards presents a direct discrimination which is unsurprising given that Africans have long been subject to racism in Spain. In addition to this, it is reported that migrants are required to produce extra documentation such as proof of employment in order to rent (Harrison et al, 2005). This is not required from Spanish nationals, but is further problematic to Africans, as many of them are illegal migrants lacking proof of employment. Both requirements of documentation and higher prices for migrants are arguably put in place to deter Africans from settling in a community. This clearly displays an intention to segregate and expel Africans from the Spanish community, which reflects the deep-rooted nature of anti-African attitudes. Additionally, the extra documents required in order for migrants to rent displays a distinct xenophobic trait of housing agencies. This is related to the general rise in xenophobia in Europe, as increase in migration has led to reluctance to accept migrants in countries with high unemployment rates (Corkill, 2001).

For Africans who manage to rent housing, the poor conditions inevitably leads to a decline in both physical and mental health and general well-being which cannot be remedied as health care is no longer easily accessible for migrants (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014). In 2011, a new government changed Spain's social priorities in a way which meant that health care became inaccessible (Rodríguez-Planas and Vegas, 2014). Laws introduced in 2012 require migrants to register in their area in order to access health care (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013). This provided an enormous barrier for undocumented migrants, which was acknowledged in 2015 (Badcock, 2015). Spain now allows free health care to undocumented migrants, but the law still affects legal migrants. For many African migrants who live rurally for employment, public transport is not available in order for legal migrants to register for these services (Paloma et al, 2014), and so the legal requirement only hinders access to services. This lack of transport equally affects undocumented migrants who are entitled to free health care, and so health services are still difficult to access for all migrants. Alongside the physical barrier, there is a lack of confidence in the services and a language barrier which is perceived as an obstacle to health care (Paloma et al, 2014). It has been documented that Moroccans in particular are reluctant to use Spanish health services, due to a perceived lack of cultural acceptance in community services (Paloma et al, 2014). Clearly, the poor well-being and ill-health of migrants is an indirect result of both physical and cultural segregation, and an internalised sense of rejection in Moroccan migrants which prevents them from accepting health care due to fears of marginalisation. This fear has effectively withdrawn African migrants from society, inhibiting their access to services and inevitably furthering their segregation.

Cultural Intolerance within Education and Society
Spain's historic inflation of cultural identity and religion is reflected in its education system, which nurtures the segregation of African migrant children through teachings of only Catholic views (ECRI, 2005). Some schools have been reported to exercise discretion in appointing children to schools, and outright refusing to take children of both Roma and African background (ECRI, 2005). This is supposedly attributed to negative mediatisation of migrants, depicting them as a security threat (ECRI,

2005), although Africans have long been considered outsiders in Spain. For African migrant children in particular, there is difficulty in receiving the required support in both the learning of their own religion in schools and the teaching of Spanish children about cultural diversity and acceptance. While it is an optional subject at secondary schools, subjects on cultural diversity and religion are not compulsory either at primary or secondary levels (ECRI, 2005). This has meant that Spanish children have little knowledge of other cultures, and are not taught to tolerate other religious beliefs. Roman Catholicism is, however, a compulsory subject to be taught in schools, although attendance is optional (ECRI, 2011). This shows a distinct lack of acceptance of other religions and avoidance of cultures other than the accepted Spanish tradition, which effectively allows schools to teach only Spanish cultures, and regard other cultures as lacking importance. Despite this hostility towards other cultures, migrant children are increasingly given opportunities to attend classes in summer to learn Spanish (ECRI, 2011), in order to better integrate non-Spanish students into a Spanish classroom. While this attempt at integration shows a willingness to include the children, the lack of education on other cultures means that Spain is only making efforts to assimilate them, rather than encouraging acceptance of them by Spanish children. This effectively labels non-Catholic cultures as 'other', and symbolically excludes anyone of other faith. Teaching methods inadvertently further this idea of 'the other' as they tend to use language which clearly makes distinctions between Spanish and Moroccans. In teaching, distinctions are drawn between the different languages used by Moroccans and Spanish children, seating Moroccan children on other tables as they "will have to speak Moroccan" (García-Sánchez, 2013, p.490). Although this may be helpful or comforting for Moroccan children, it prevents the integration of Moroccan children in the classroom, and allows Spanish children to ignore migrant children, facilitating their exclusion in society.

Spain has attempted to combat exclusion of migrants by providing legal measures which allow Muslim children the right to be taught religious instruction on Islam (ECRI, 2011). This provides extra rights for African children, as the majority of them are of Islamic faith (ECRI, 2003). Although, the existence of this measure does not warrant the assumption that it is practiced. The Spanish education industry lacks teachers of Islam, with only 46 employed in the whole of Spain in 2011 (ECRI). This suggests that, although there is demand for teaching based on Islam, Spain is unable to provide this. This is not due to a lack of willing teachers of Islam, but the fact that these teachers are rejected based on their lack of university degree (ECRI, 2011). In addition, reports suggest that where schools are under state control, there are a higher number of teachers of Islam, whereas in locally governed schools it is more likely that schools will not employ even one teacher of Islam (ECRI, 2011). This suggests that it is the state only which is attempting to combat marginalisation of Muslims, and measures put in place are confronted with non-compliance by local authorities and on an individual level. It is apparent from this that the state imposes measures which intend for the country to integrate immigrants, but individual prejudices remain, preventing these measures from being enforced and allowing them to become meaningless. It may also be said however, that the provision of a right to be taught Islam can further segregate African migrant children. If Spanish children are not taught cultural tolerance, migrant children who attend different lessons to be taught Islam will necessarily be further ostracised as different. Integration would be far easier for Muslim children if Spanish children were taught to tolerate other religions and accept difference in culture. The lack of cultural teachings in the Spanish education system nurtures the next generation to continue society's lack of cultural tolerance and acceptance.

The state does not provide legal protection of Islamic faith outside of schools however, showing reluctance to give other religions foundations in Spain, for the protection of the Catholic Spanish culture. There remain only 700 mosques in Spain to support a population of Muslims which is estimated to be over 1.5 million (ECRI, 2011), with applications for building other mosques routinely rejected. Rejection of mosque planning permissions has resulted in Muslims congregating in what are termed "garage mosques" (ECRI, 2011, p.27), which are private garages which become used for prayer. Clearly there is a demand for mosques, and refusal of applications simply depicts Spain's xenophobic disposition towards Muslims migrants and their inflated sense of threat from other religions. Muslims are effectively denied the ability to practice their own religion in Spain, alongside a distinct avoidance of Islamic teachings in school. Although this may be argued to reflect the European sense of Islamophobia, Spain's rejection of Islam is more historically ingrained in society. Unlike other countries in Europe, Spain has not experienced an increase in racial hate and violence since 9/11 (ECRI, 2011), but instead Muslims have always endured this racial hostility in Spanish society. In some ways, Spain's

government can be seen to be combating racism, but the few measures which have been put in place to do so are having no effect. As a result, both adults and children in the migrant community remain marginalised and culturally segregated, with an expectation that they should integrate into society. When facing segregation, exclusion and intolerance in so many areas of Spanish society, it is impossible for African migrants to simply integrate instantly into society, considering the public, authorities and state provide so many barriers to their equal treatment.

NGO/Union Activity: Supporting Migrants in the Spanish Migration Debate
Public acceptance of migrants has inevitably rested upon current events and developments within Spain's discourse as a whole. Initially, the influx of migrants was met with xenophobia, but as public discourse has moved on, shifts in Spain's regional languages and economic stance have meant that migrants are now more readily accepted should they know Catalan and be involved in voluntary work, as a sign of willingness to integrate (Codó and Garrido, 2014). Although Spanish is the dominant national language, speaking Catalan is perceived to give access to social circles and the ability to thrive in higher employment (Codó and Garrido, 2014). NGOs initially taught Spanish to migrants before switching to Catalan teachings in 2008, meaning that less recent migrants may now benefit from learning Catalan as a third language in order to be more accepted in employment and society. Naively, scholars suggest that migrants should undergo the same language assimilation as other citizens, but not all migrants have access to this facility. It is unlikely that migrants segregated in rural agricultural areas are able to learn a language at all, due to a lack of transport and exclusion from circles of information. This creates barriers for rural migrants in particular, as their exclusion from social discourse means they are most likely unaware this aid is available and therefore unable to acquire the skills which will afford them better employment and integration. As Spain endures further economic struggles and rising unemployment rates, increased value has also been given to those who volunteer in the community to help out businesses (Codó and Garrido, 2014). However access remains an issue for migrants who are excluded to rural areas. In Spain, it would seem that migrants are expected to adapt to the current political views of the country and value is placed upon those who adhere to this. This is consistent with maintaining Spain's cultural identity through assimilation, segregating those who refuse or are unable to assimilate as multiculturalism threatens to dilute the Spanish cultural identity. Indeed, these expectations assume migrants have access to circles of information, yet migrants who remain segregated through their rural employment are unable to access information or the skills which will allow them to be more accepted. This would indicate that in order for all migrants to access these skills, NGOs should direct their attention to migrants who work or live in the most segregated and excluded areas to give equal opportunity to all migrants.

Many rural migrants are African and so not only disadvantaged through a lack of access to skills but are subject to racist practices in employment and other sectors which segregate this group further in comparison to other migrants. To combat this huge disadvantage within migrant exclusion, NGOs and trade unions have focused their efforts on reducing anti-African racism from a national level, which has had little impact in reality for African migrants. The initial non-governmental response to racism arose from attacks on African migrants, which formed physical expression of Spain's intolerance towards the group. During 2000, "Moor hunts" were held in a local agricultural village, El Ejido (Barrero, 2003, p.526), in which African migrants were attacked by locals at their workplace. The attacks came about from the murder of a Spanish woman, by a mentally ill Moroccan working in the greenhouses of the town (Barrero, 2003). The targeting of Africans as a response clearly mirrors historic attitudes, indicating that they still influence how Africans are perceived in Spain. The initial murder was explained by the poor mental health of the worker, and NGOs and trade unions have consistently fought against segregation and exclusion from facilities as a response (Meardi et al, 2012). Unions acknowledge that migrants are essential to the Spanish economy, but gathering members from migrant communities is difficult, as migrants are only annually employed and many of these are undocumented (Meardi et al, 2012). Due to their segregation and informal employment, migrants lack information about trade unions, and most union members only join after 3 years of employment (Meardi et al, 2012). Africans and Moroccans are particularly underrepresented in unions despite forming the majority of the migrant population (Meardi et al, 2012), and therefore tactics to reduce racism against this group of workers is hugely reliant on the union's awareness of the issue. Despite the lack of representation from African migrants, trade unions have attempted to tackle racism from both a national and local level.

Trade unions such as CCOO have a long historical background and are one of the largest trade unions in Spain (Martínez Lucio et al, 2013), using this grounding to involve themselves in government debate, to help develop policies and rules against racist selection processes. Arguably, this is not enough to alleviate the problem, as inclusion policies which are set at national level are still not necessarily implemented on more local levels due to racism within agencies and individual employers. To combat this, unions have attempted to engage with businesses and communities locally and have successfully established some forums in towns to facilitate fairer selection processes in employment in the agricultural sector (Martínez Lucio et al, 2013). The success of this is not widespread however, as unions are unable to reach the very rural areas of Spain, which arguably need them the most, and so a large proportion of African migrants are left detached and unable to access advice and help. As a result, trade unions have taken to visiting agricultural sites in order to monitor the treatment of workers (Martínez Lucio et al, 2013). The importance of this cannot be understated, as the swift annual movement of workers means that employers can easily return to discriminatory selection processes within a year.

While union and NGO agendas are on track towards equality among migrants, their work does not necessarily change the terrible working conditions which migrants must endure nor combat migrant disadvantage as a whole. For migrants in Spain, reality is a position of "maximum risk and minimum voice" (Meardi et al, 2012, p.19). Public discourse pressures migrants to assimilate to the Spanish culture or face segregation to low-paid dangerous employment, with little work from trade unions to support multiculturalism. Essentially, the current migrant situation mirrors Spain's repetitive and historical attitude of assimilation or exclusion, suggesting that Spanish society maintains the perception of a threat to its culture. Unsurprisingly then, the growing sense of xenophobia in Spain (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2013) indicates that it is the individual which drastically influences the general reception of migrants. Public discourse inevitably reflects the views of the nation, and the continuance of anti-migrant practices in housing and anti-African practices in employment indicates that the country's perception of Africans and migrants as a whole can only be effectively changed from an individual level. The historic perception of African inferiority clearly remains within the people's minds, and so no matter the policies put in place to stabilise and equalise migrant positions, these policies are inevitably ignored and unenforced. In order for non-government organisations to effectively combat anti-African racism and tackle the disadvantages migrants face as a whole, it is necessary to engage with communities on an individual level in order to educate against exclusionary practices.

<u>Concluding Comments</u>

The racial discourse in Spanish society and industry is strongly rooted in historical hostilities towards Moroccans, leading to anti-Islam and anti-African racisms which are unlike those in Western Europe, but rather tailored to Spain's own history. The exclusionary discourse is based upon a framework which was initially encouraged by the state, promoting traditional Catholic views and overinflating other religions as a threat to the country's identity. The discourse perceives other religions and therefore other races as inferior outsiders. This framework has been adapted during the recent migration crisis to exclude migrants due to feelings of resentment, but maintains Africans as the most marginalised and segregated group in Spain. Most race literature focuses on Spanish racism towards Moroccans. However, newer literature looks at the impact of racism in Spain on Africans in general, showing that anti-Moroccan racisms have now been generalised towards Africans as a whole. This group have consistently represented the majority of migrant workers in Spain, yet are treated with the most hostility and segregated from Spanish society in ways which other migrants are not, due to the persistence of historic attitudes. Preferential treatment of other migrants over Africans has led them to be restricted in their access to employment and housing, with half of African migrants now unable to find employment due to racism in local selection processes. Inevitably, preventing Africans from finding work has led them to be the least economically stable of all migrants. These problems flow directly from the exclusion of Africans from work and society, and as these issues have been recognised, trade unions have made attempts to restore equality to employment selection processes with only marginal success. The state has recently passed legislation to help migrants integrate, depicting a turnaround in their attitude towards migrants. Changes made on a national scale have been ineffective however, as anti-racism policies have been left unenforced due to racism remaining in the attitudes of employers, agencies and the public, leaving migrants in the same isolated position. The problem therefore lies in the minds of the individuals and society itself, as an exclusionary mind-set prevents African migrants

from being accepted by Spanish society or accessing employment with equal opportunity. This issue must necessarily be rectified, as more migrants, including Africans, are now leaving the country than entering. It is therefore predictable that Spain's agricultural market will grow weaker, with Spanish nationals refusing to take roles in the industry, yet driving out the workers who maintain it. As unemployment rises for African migrants, it is unlikely that these workers will return unless conditions in employment and other areas change. For Africans, working in Spain is no longer a beneficial option, as many are unable to find work in order to achieve a better life for their families. Perhaps this downturn in migrants will be welcomed, as Spain's hostilities towards them rise, however the plummeting of migrant numbers will only solidify Spain's exclusion of migrants and leave racisms towards Africans unresolved.

Bibliography

Arango, J. 2013. *Exceptional in Europe? Spain's Experience with Immigration and Integration.* Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute.

Badcock, J. 2015. Spain to allow illegal immigrants to access free public healthcare. [Online]. [Accessed on 23 November 2015]. Available at: http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/spain/11509227/Spain-to-allow-illegal-immigrants-to-access-free-public-healthcare.html

Balfour, S. 2002. *Deadly Embrace: Morocco and the Road to the Spanish Civil War*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Barrero, R. Z. 2003. The "Discovery" of immigration in Spain: the politicization of immigration in the case of El Ejido. *Journal of International Migration and Integration.* **4**(4), pp.523-539.

Borreguero, E. 2006. The Moors are coming, the Moors are coming! Encounters with Muslims in Contemporary Spain. *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations.* **17**(4), pp.417-432.

Buck, T. 2014. Migration: The drain from Spain. [Online]. [Accessed on 4 January 2016]. Available at: http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/f7bdd5ce-995e-11e3-91cd-00144feab7de.html#axzz3wHe8YEnS

Codó, E. and Garrido, M. R. 2014. Shifting discourses of migrant incorporation at a time of crisis: understanding the articulation of language and labour in the Catalan non-governmental sector. *International Journal of Multilingualism*. **11**(4), pp.389-408.

Corkill, D. 2011. Immigrants and a regional economy in Spain: the case of Murcia. *International Journal of Iberian Studies*. **18**(1), pp.23-36.

Corkill, D. 2001. Economic migrants and the labour market in Spain and Portugal. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. **24**(5), pp.828-844.

Domínguez-Mujica, J. Guerra-Talavera, R. and Parreño-Castellano, J. M. 2014. Migration at a time of global economic crisis: The situation in Spain. *International Migration*. **52**(6), pp.113-127.

Escandell, X. and Ceobanu, A. M. 2009. When contact with immigrants matters: threat, interethnic attitudes and foreigner exclusionism in Spain's Comunidades Autónomas. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* **32**(1), pp.44-69.

European Commission against Racism and Intolerance. 2003-2011. *Reports on Spain*. [Online]. [Accessed on 21 November 2015]. Available at: http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/default_en.asp

Eurostat. 2015. Unemployment Statistics. [Online]. [Accessed on 15 November 2015]. Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Unemployment_statistics

García-Sánchez, I. 2013. The everyday politics of "cultural citizenship" among North African immigrant school children in Spain. *Language and Communication*. **33**(4), pp.481-499.

Goldberg, D. 2009. Racial comparisons, relational racisms: some thoughts on method. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* **32**(7), pp.1271-1282.

Harrison, M., Law, I. and Phillips, D. 2005. *Migrants, Minorities and Housing: Exclusion, Discrimination and Anti-Discrimination in 15 Member States of the European Union.* European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia.

Hering Torres, M.S., Martínez M.E. and Nirenberg D. 2012. *Race and Blood in the Iberian World.* Zürich: LIT, Verlag Münster.

Law, I. 2009. *Racism and Ethnicity: Global Debates, Dilemmas and Directions.* Harlow: Longman.

Martínez Lucio, M., Marino, S. and Connolly, H. 2013. Broadening and reimagining regulation: Trade unions, 'active servicing' and immigration in Spain since the early 1990s. *Journal of Industrial Relations.* **55**(2), pp.190-211.

Martinez Veiga, U. 2014. What tourists don't see: housing, concentration of poverty and ethnic conflict in a Spanish migrant ghetto. *Dialectical Anthropology.* **38**(1), pp.59-77.

Meardi, G., Martín, A. and Riera, M. L. 2012. Constructing Uncertainty: Unions and Migrant Labour in Construction in Spain and the UK. *Journal of Industrial Relations*. **54**(1), pp.5-21.

Meer, N. 2014. *Racialization and Religion: Race, Culture and Difference in the Study of Antisemitism and Islamophobia.* Ethnic and Racial Studies. New York: Routledge.

Meier, S. 2013. Housing market integration of migrants: Moroccans in Spain. Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie. **104**(3), pp.308-321.

Modood, T. 2005. *Foreword.* In: Abbas, T. ed. *Muslim Britain: Communities under Pressure.* London: Zed Books.

Paloma, V., García-Ramirez, M. and Camacho, C. 2014. Well-Being and Social Justice Among Moroccan Migrants in Southern Spain. *American Journal of Community Psychology.* **54**(1), pp.1-11.

Pérez, J. 1993. *History of a Tragedy: The Expulsion of the Jews from Spain.* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Rodríguez-Planas, N. and Vegas, R. 2014. Do Moroccan migrants to Spain fare better or worse than other migrants? *Middle East Development Journal*. **6**(2), pp.308-328.

Sánchez-Pardo, E. 2011. Adrift on the Black Mediterranean Diaspora: African Migrant writing in Spain. *Social Identities.* **17**(1), pp.105-120.

Singhji, M. 2011. Review: Blood and Faith: The Purging of Muslim Spain 1492-1614. *Race and Class.* **52**(4), pp.116-118.

Sole, C. and Parella, S. 2003. The labour market and racial discrimination in Spain. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies.* **29**(1), pp.121-140.

Soyer, F. 2013. Faith, Culture and Fear: Comparing Islamophobia in early Modern Spain and Twenty-First Century Europe. *Ethnic and Racial Studies.* **36**(3), pp.399-416.

Spanish Institute of Statistics. 2015. [Online]. [Accessed on 15 November 2015]. Available at: http://www.ine.es/jaxi/menu.do?type=pcaxis&path=/t20/e245/&file=inebase

United Nations Human Rights Council. 2013. *Report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, Mutuma Ruteere: Visit to Spain.* [Online]. [Accessed 25 October 2015]. Available at: http://www.ohchr.org

van Dijk, T. 2005. *Racism and Discourse in Spain and Latin America.* Philadelphia: John Benjamins B.V.